

**Report to the ESRC Regarding the
Association for Heterodox Economics Advanced Methodology
Workshop,
which took place Dec. 9-11, 2002
Chancellors' Conference Centre, Manchester**

This report includes a summary of activities undertaken; an evaluation; a summary of expenditures compared with planned spending; and a concluding note. The workshop management is being led by Dr. Paul Downward (Reader in Economics) of Staffordshire Business School from March 2003 onward, but the team based strategy toward the workshop will continue. The participants list is found at Appendix 4.

Activities Undertaken

The three-day workshop consisted of a series of one-to-three hour sessions, as described in the attached Schedule. Each speaker was responsible for roughly a half-day of activities, which included discussion and exercises as well as lecturing time. The Workshop created an atmosphere for exploration of alternatives to orthodox economics whilst nevertheless regularly revisiting the standard assumptions of particular theories or models. Specific issues which arose included modelling, causation, the nature of econometrics, operationalisation, complex causation, interpretation, epistemology, and the non-neutral nature of formalised theory. Speakers revisited these themes even though there was a lead speaker for each of them.

A brief summary of speakers and themes is shown below.

- ❖ Prof. Fred Lee - grounded theory and theory-building; interpreting qualitative data
- ❖ Prof. V. Chick - models of time-dependent paths; open and closed-system models vs. reality
- ❖ Dr. Monastiriotis - regression models and their variants; labour market integration theory
- ❖ Dr. Fleetwood - an institutionalist approach to labour markets as a form of theorising
- ❖ Dr. Downward - variants on the practices of econometrics; necessary versus undesirable assumptions in the doing of econometric research; applications in the consumption of leisure services
- ❖ Dr. Olsen (1) - causal analysis; operationalisation; path diagrams; referentiality of variables to objects
- ❖ Dr. Olsen (2) - discourse analysis and grounded theory; annotating qualitative data using software

The workshop was advertised through posters sent to AHE members; through extensive use of email lists which are highly targeted; and through a final postal mailing. The numbers who registered were far below the numbers contracted for, but well above our minimum number. The group of roughly 18 who participated together found the discussion went very well due to small numbers. Lecturers participated (for varying periods from 4 hours to 3 days) alongside graduate students.

Every participant received a two-volume set of papers underpinning the presentations made. The contents of the two volumes are appended to this report (paper version only). Papers by each speaker were included, along with papers printed in the *Cambridge Journal of Economics*, other journal articles, and sections from books by Tony Lawson and Derek Layder.

The Workshop ran for three days from early Monday morning to mid-day on Wednesday. The Workshop had two rooms booked, but due to low student numbers the second room was used only for printing purposes and was not needed as a breakout room. Internet access was arranged during the Workshop both for email and webpage viewing. Students were exposed to four pieces of software: Inspirations for diagramming causal processes; NVIVO for annotating qualitative data; NUDist which preceded NVIVO and lacks a graphical modelling module; and STATA which is a suitable replacement for SPSS for those who wish to do cross-sectional modelling, fixed-effects modelling, or time-series modelling. Students were also exposed to case studies of qualitative economic research including ethnographic notebooks, annotated images and advertising, and interview transcripts.

Evaluation of the Workshop

The comments of students were elicited both on the workshop in general and on each speaker's contribution. 12 responses were received. The questionnaires were anonymously completed, making it difficult to know which participant forgot to give their questionnaire in. Each positive aspect of a speaker's contribution was assessed on a 1 to 5 scale, with 5 meaning excellent; for each speaker separate records were made of how well structured their presentation was versus how useful it would be for the students. The overall average of all these scales was 4.1, indicating a high level of satisfaction overall. The table below illustrates some of the variation in satisfaction:

Key:

S = 'How well structured was the presentation?'

Range: 5=very well . . . 1 = not at all well.

U = "How relevant and useful was this topic or session to your research career?"

Range: 5=very well . . . 1 = not at all well.

DOWNWARD		FLEETWOOD		LEE		MONASTIRIOTIS	
S	U	S	U	S	U	S	U
4.3	4.4	4.4	3.6	4.3	3.9	3.9	4.3

CHICK		OLSEN1		OLSEN2	
S	U	S	U	S	U
4.2	4.3	4.2	3.7	3.9	3.9

The abbreviated session names referred to here are:

Downward 'Applied Heterodox Research: A Critique'

Fleetwood 'Labour Relations'

Lee 'Grounded Theory and Economic Research'

Monastiriotis 'Regression Models/ Multi-Causal Approach'

Chick 'Open Systems and their Implications'

Olsen 'Qualitative Data Demonstration'

Olsen 'Path Analysis and Multi-Level Analysis'

The variations show that students welcomed the chance to distinguish between how good the structure of the presentation was, versus how useful the topic is for them. The staff concerned are being sent this report containing the summary of responses.

Qualitative Comments on the Workshop

The general comments included the following:

- ✓ Variety of topics/approaches
- ✓ Responsive atmosphere
- ✓ The friendly, informal and open minded atmosphere helped the discussion
- ✓ Well organised

- ✗ More exercises to be done by students
- ✗ Other approaches other than critical realism need to be included
- ✗ Any possibility of or organising a walk around the University

In addition more specific comments, shortened here, included:

How students found out about the Workshop:

Half of those who responded said they heard about it from their supervisor. The other half mentioned email-based sources. About four students did not respond on this point.

Suggested avenues of advertising for a future Workshop:

Several students noted that we could "send emails to the relevant departments". One student wrote: "Email the director of postgraduate studies and ask to pass this information to the postgraduate students. A poster to be put up in the noticeboards of the departments, transferring the poster through people who attended the workshop in previous years." The students still think that email is the best route for information. However they also mentioned the importance of posters in Departments.

Summary of Expenditures

The workshop expenditures, totalling £7065, fell short of the amount ESRC had agreed to spend. We think three reasons account for this shortfall: 1) holding the workshop in December in Manchester was not as popular as holding it in London last November; it was too close to the end of term and it was too far north for some people; 2) economists are ignoring 'spam' email, and the initial mailings to targeted email lists were perhaps seen as 'spam' and thus did not generate the interest one would have expected in earlier years. A targeted postal mailing using the EAEPE, IAFFE and AHE address lists was much more successful in generating participants -- but this mailing was carried out in November, too late to be of use to some students. The CHUDE list of heads of economics departments was not used for the email advertising because a charge of £70 has been introduced and we did not have a budget heading for such a payment. 3) Manchester is a cheaper venue than London, so the per-capita costs were less than would have to be budgeted for if London were the venue.

One lesson for next year is to advertise *in print using coloured paper targeted to relevant academic staff*.

As observed in 2001, we also found that academic staff are not willing or able to attend for three days, so training supervisors has not been central to the services delivered by the Workshop. However one supervisor did attend (from Portugal).

The total expenditure has both income and spending components, as summarised below.

Income

Fees paid by student participants:	£325
Special fee by one Lecturer participant	£160
Total revenue:	£485

Spending

Secretarial support	£426.20
Speaker fees	£1049.07
Travel claims of students and staff	£925.64
Stationery (CCSR)	£379.98
Postage (explicit)	£30

Photocopying charges (CCSR)	£135
Telephone charges (CCSR)	£20
Computer consumables (NVIVO software)	£137.98
Room hire, accommodation and subsistence	£3960.80
Total spending:	£7064.67
Fees contributed as a percentage of total:	7%
Net invoice amount for ESRC:	£6579.67

The original expenditure plans allowed for more student participants, whose contribution would have doubled if we had met the target of 35. When we held the event in London we exceeded this target. We had 18 students registered during the week before the event, but regrettably four of them fell sick or otherwise were unable to come. They sent their apologies and gave good cause for absence so were not charged a registration fee. The managers of Chancellors' Conference Centre did not charge for accommodating or feeding those who didn't show up. The invoice for Chancellors includes only rooms, food, and drinks actually used. There was no waste in spite of the last-minute changes in numbers, thanks to the efficient and responsive work of the Chancellors' staff. Olsen and Mendez actively intervened to ensure that there were no misunderstandings between the AHE and the Chancellors staff.

The secretarial staffing was provided by a sociology PhD student, Maria-Luisa Mendez. She provided a registration service, typed the evaluation form and accommodation list, drafted the evaluation summary, and helped to ensure that money received was safely deposited and that everyone present did pay their Registration Fee. In CCSR additional implicit support from the Administrator was not charged for.

Conclusions

The lessons for next year include the following suggestions.

Develop an advertising strategy that uses printed paper rather than (or in addition to) email, and which is closely targeted to relevant academic staff. Do not rely upon email recipients to print off a poster. Instead, send them a poster by ordinary post.

Hold the event in a desirable location and season.

Offer a certificate of completion so students can incorporate their Workshop attendance into their portfolio of self-development during the PhD.

Ensure that a spread of academic staff present the workshop material.

Appendices:

1. Paper poster sent to departments and EAEPE, IAFFE, and other UK heterodox economists
2. Web advert basic
3. Web advert detailed

Please note that a fourth Appendix, consisting of the mailing list to which a poster was sent, has been sent directly to the organisers of the next proposed AHE Workshop (Downward et al.) and is omitted here.

Appendix 1. Paper poster sent to departments and EAEPE, IAFFE, and other UK heterodox economists

Association for Heterodox Economics Post-Graduate Training Workshop

*“Advanced Methods for Pluralist and Interdisciplinary
Economics Research”*

9th to 11th December 2002 (for 2nd Year PhD students & others)



PROGRAMME

Speaker	Topic	Time	Day	Venue
Downward P.	Applied Heterodox Research	9 am-10:30 am	Monday 9 Dec.	Flat lecture hall, the Chancellor's Conference Centre, Univ. of Manchester
Fleetwood S.	Labour relations	From 11 am to 1 pm (+discussion)	Monday 9 Dec.	Flat lecture hall, the Chancellor's Conference Centre
Lee F.	Grounded Theory and Economic Research	Approx from 2 pm to 4 pm (+ 1 hour exercise 9-10 am Tuesday)	Monday 9 Dec.	Flat lecture hall, the Chancellor's Conference Centre, Univ. of Manchester
Chick	Open Systems and their Implications	10 am to 12 pm (+ 1 hour discussion period 12-1 pm)	Tuesday 10 Dec.	Flat lecture hall, the Chancellor's Conference Centre, Univ. of Manchester
Monastiriotis	Regression Models and the Multi-Causal Approach	From 2 – 4; Workshop 4-5 looking at students' data and topics (Olsen also supporting)	Tuesday 10 Dec.	Flat lecture hall, the Chancellor's Conference Centre, Univ. of Manchester Bring your laptop and data for the Workshop Please
all staff to facilitate, working in small groups	Practical session	12-1 pm	Tuesday 10 Dec.	Breakout into discussion areas to consider the open systems and social-relations approaches.
Olsen	Qualitative Data Demonstration	4-5 pm	Tuesday 10 Dec.	public area -- demonstrating what digital tape recorders and qualitative software can do for researchers.
Olsen	Path analysis and multilevel analysis: Advantages of using multi-method research strategies	9-10.30 am	Wednesday 11 Dec.	Flat lecture hall, the Chancellor's Conference Centre, Univ. of Manchester
Olsen with Monastiriotis	Statistical applications integrating qualitative <i>or</i> multilevel with ordinary regression*	11-1 pm	Wednesday 11 Dec	Main hall

If you would like to have more information, please see:

<http://www.ccsr.ac.uk/staff/wkolsen/workshopDetails.htm>

Or contact Maria-Luisa Mendez for details: maria-luisa.mendez@stud.man.ac.uk

Association for Heterodox Economics

2nd Post-Graduate Training Workshop

*"Getting From Hypotheses to Conclusions:
Advanced Methods for Pluralist and Interdisciplinary
Economics Research"*

2002

The workshop is to be held December 9th, 9 am to Dec. 11th 2 pm and will be held at:

Chancellors Conference Centre
University of Manchester
years 2-4l

-- subsidised for eligible PhD students in

B&B&Evening Meals&Travel

For those eligible, subsidy includes

Invited speakers include Vicki Chick, Steve Fleetwood and others as well as two international speakers

Each person still has to pay 25 pounds though.

Steve Fleetwood has confirmed that he will speak on 'How (not) to do causal explanation in labour markets', with reference to recently published work of his in *Review of Social Economy* and other work.

Workshop facilitators include Wendy Olsen and are likely to also include other active members of AHE in the UK/Ireland.

A Workshop handbook consisting of papers by all the presenters and more will be given – last year it ran to two volumes.

The workshop will have discussion, Q&A, seminar, and practical components including:

- specialist applications of advanced statistical skills, notably linking-up a statistics package with interview transcript data;
- specialist applications of advanced qualitative skills, notably grounded theory and discourse analysis;
- developing the capacity for originality as well as social worth and policy relevance in economic research, which will in turn have knock-on effects on pedagogy and on the ability to apply the learning that takes place during the PhD.
- encouraging researchers to work within a context of methodological and theoretical triangulation

Social theorists, realists, feminists, marxists, post-keynesians, empirical researchers, and all others who consider themselves under the umbrella of heterodoxy are welcome to the workshop. For a list of 650 people who have signed up to a statement favouring heterodoxy over orthodoxy, please see the website of the Post-Autistic Economics Review.

Specifically:

http://www.btinternet.com/~pae_news/Campproposal.htm

Association for Heterodox Economics

2nd Post-Graduate Training Workshop

"Getting From Hypotheses to Conclusions:

*Advanced Methods for Pluralist and Interdisciplinary
Economics Research"*

2002

All are Welcome to Attend. However you must Register. To register, fill in and post us the form located at www.ccsr.ac.uk/staff/wkolsen/aheregister.htm

Registration does not make you eligible for a subsidy. Indeed you must pay a 25 pound fee (cheques payable to the University of Manchester) if you register. You may pay this fee at the time of registration. This is why we ask you to post your registration form to us.

Details of the Programme

Agreed speakers: Victoria Chick, Steve Fleetwood, Fred Lee, Wendy Olsen, V. Monastriotis, and Paul Downward.

Speaker	Topic	Time	Day	Venue
Downward P.	Applied Heterodox Research	9 am-10:30 am	Monday 9 Dec.	Flat lecture hall, the Chancellor's Conference Centre, Univ. of Manchester
Fleetwood S.	Labour relations	From 11 am to 1 pm (+ 1 hour discussion period 4-5 pm)	Monday 9 Dec.	Flat lecture hall, the Chancellor's Conference Centre, Univ. of Manchester
Lee F.	Grounded Theory and Economic Research	Approx from 2 pm to 4 pm (+ 1 hour discussion period and exercise 9-10 am Tuesday)	Monday 9 Dec.	Flat lecture hall, the Chancellor's Conference Centre, Univ. of Manchester
Chick	Open Systems and their	10 am to 12 pm (+ 1 hour	Tuesday 10 Dec.	Flat lecture hall, the Chancellor's Conference

	Implications	discussion period 12-1 pm)		Centre, Univ. of Manchester
Monastiriotis	Regression Models and the Multi-Causal Approach	From 2 – 4; Workshop 4-5 looking at students' data and topics (Olsen also supporting)	Tuesday 10 Dec.	Flat lecture hall, the Chancellor's Conference Centre, Univ. of Manchester Bring your laptop and data for the Workshop Please
all staff to facilitate, working in small groups	Practical session	12-1 pm	Tuesday 10 Dec.	Breakout into discussion areas to consider the open systems and social-relations approaches to your own topics – aided by Fleetwood, Lee, Chick.
Olsen	Qualitative Handling Data Demonstration	4-5 pm	Tuesday 10 Dec.	public area -- demonstrating what digital tape recorders and qualitative software can do for researchers.
Olsen	Path analysis and multilevel analysis: Advantages of using multi-method research strategies	9-10.30 am	Wednesday 11 Dec.	Flat lecture hall, the Chancellor's Conference Centre, Univ. of Manchester
Olsen with Monastiriotis	Statistical applications integrating qualitative or multilevel with ordinary regression*	11-1 pm	Wednesday 11 Dec	Main hall

* Demonstrating three pieces of software in action: NVIVO, which organises thoughts and qualitative data; INSPIRATIONS, which creates flowcharts and other diagrams, including path diagrams; and finally MLWIN, which does multilevel regression after you have created a good clean data set. *Bring your clean data set as a single matrix in spreadsheet format.* We assume you are familiar with SPSS etc. already.

Steve Fleetwood has confirmed that he will speak on 'How (not) to do causal explanation in labour markets', with reference to recently published work of his in *Review of Social Economy* and other work.

Victoria Chick has confirmed that she will speak about open systems and formalism, and she refers you to a recent paper by her and Sheila Dow in the *Journal of Post-Keynesian Economics*.

Paul Downward is the editor of a collection of papers on heterodox research methods, and these papers may be available at the workshop. The work is forthcoming (Downward, ed., London: Routledge).

There will be a mixture of talks, demonstrations, discussions and one group practical task.

There will be pre-reading and a set of printed readings.

Both qualitative and quantitative research methods will be covered.

Details of Eligibility for Subsidy

Meals&Travel

For those eligible, subsidy includes B&B&Evening

Each person still has to pay 25 pounds though.

Workshop facilitators include Wendy Olsen and are likely to also include other active members of AHE in the UK/Ireland.

A Workshop handbook consisting of papers by all the presenters and more will be given – last year it ran to two volumes.

Details of the Objectives of the Workshop

- specialist applications of advanced statistical skills, notably linking-up a statistics package with interview transcript data;
- specialist applications of advanced qualitative skills, notably grounded theory and discourse analysis;
- developing the capacity for originality as well as social worth and policy relevance in economic research, which will in turn have knock-on effects on pedagogy and on the ability to apply the learning that takes place during the PhD.
- encouraging researchers to work within a context of methodological and theoretical triangulation

Details of What a Heterodox Economist 'Is' or, Better, What Heterodox Economics is Like

The definition of heterodoxy is contested because the borderline of orthodoxy is contested. Many researchers do pieces of work both within and without the neoclassical paradigm, so clearly heterodoxy is not simply non-neoclassical. Among institutionalists, for instance, many researchers combine insights from both old and new institutionalism (e.g. Hodgson refers to Veblen; but Hodgson also appreciates the work of North etc.). Many institutionalists would consider their work to be heterodox at times. The Workshop will no doubt generate further clarifications of these various borderlines, but it is abundantly clear that labelling a *person* is less appropriate than labelling a *piece of research* or a *set of assumptions*. That way, we can talk about/across assumptions. For this reason much heterodox research could be thought of as pluralist. Books on pluralism in economics include the edited volumes by Samuels, W., and by Screpanti as well as a new edited volume by Downward (forthcoming).

Institutionalists, social theorists, realists, feminists, marxists, post-keynesians, empirical researchers, and all others who consider themselves under the umbrella of heterodoxy are welcome to the workshop. For a list of 650 people who have signed up to a statement favouring heterodoxy over orthodoxy, please see the website of the Post-Autistic Economics Review. You can look at the statement, or the related statements from the Kansas conference and in the PAE Review, using the web links.

Specifically:

http://www.btinternet.com/~pae_news/Camproposal.htm

Appendix 4: List of Participants

NAME	UNIV/DEPT	CURRENT YEAR	THESIS TITLE
BRUFF, IAN	POLIS, UNIVERSITY OF LLEDS	3RD	THE RELATIVE ECONOMIC SUCCESS OF SMALL EUROPEAN COUNTRIES: THE ROLE OF CULTURE AND LABOUR MARKET
CRUDEL, LUCA	SOAS, UNIVERSITY OF LONDON	1RS (+MSC)	THE INDIVIDUAL THROUGH THE LENSES OF SOCIAL CAPITAL
FILIOU, DESPOINA	UMIST	3RD	STRATEGIC ALLIANCES IN BIOTECHNOLOGY: THE CASE OF THE UK
KASIMATI, EVANGELIA	DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS AND INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT, UNIVERITY OF BATH	2ND	THE MACROECONOMICS OF HOSTING MEGA EVENTS: A RESERARCH FOR EMPLOYMENT EFFECTS
MANSI, KAMEL	UNIVERSITY OF MANCHESTER, LABOUR STUDIES	2ND	DETERMINANTS OF WOMEN'S PARTICIPATION IN LABOUR FORCE
MCEVOY, PHIL	UNIVERSITY OF MANCHESTER, SCHOOL OF NURSING	3RD	AN EXPLORATION OF HOW THE DECISIONS MADE BY GATEKEEPERS CLINICIANS AT THE GP/CMHT INTERFACE EMERGE
MENDEZ, MARIA-LUISA	UNIVERSITY OF MANCHESTER	2nd	DEFINING SOCIAL CLASS AND ITS RECENT CHANGES IN CHILE
NEVES, VITOR	Portugal	Lecturer	
PACHECO-LOPEZ, PENELOPE (withdrawn)	UNIVERSITY OF KENT AT CANTERBURY, DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS	3RD	MEXICO'S TRADE STRUCTURE, TRADE REFORMS AND BALANCE OF PAYMENTS CENSTRAINED GROWTH
POXON, JOHN	UNIVERSITY OF TEESIDE, DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL SCIENCES	3RD	IS MARXIST THEORY STILL RELEVANT ON CLASS? AS FOR BRITISH EDUCATION IS CONCERNED?
RUZIEB, KOBIL	DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS, UNIVERSITY OF STIRLING	1RS (+MA)	PRIVATISATION OF STATE OWNED COMMERCIAL BANKS AND THE EFFECT OF THIS PROCESS ON MACROECONOMIC PERFORMANCE OF THE COUNTRY. CASE OF URBEKISTAN
SOYDAN, AYLIN	MIDDLESEX, BUSINESS SCHOOL	3RD	PUBLIC SECTOR DEFICITS AND INFLATION
STEFANOV, ILIYAN	DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS, UNIVERSITY OF DUNDEE	4TH	MORAL HAZARD IN BANKING DURING THE TRANSITION FROM CENTRALLY PLANNED ECONOMY RO A MARKET ECONOMY
VIGO, IARA	DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS, UNIVERSITY OF STIRLING	1ST	THINKING ABOUT MODERNISM AND POSTMODERNISM AS EPISTEMES
TIBA, ZOLTAN	SOAS, UNIVERSITY OF LONDON	2ND	AGRICULTURAL LIBALISATION AND FOOF SECURITY IN MALAWI

Yonnedi, Efa	Institute for Development Policy & Management, Univ. of Manchester	1st	Privatisation in Indonesia: Determinants, organisational changes and performance implications
Zhen Ye	Univ. of Hertfordshire	3rd	Transforming Institutions: The case of foreign direct investment in Siamen (China)

STUDENTS LIST

Association for Heterodox Economics

NAME	UNIV/DEPT	CURRENT YEAR	THESIS TITLE
✓ BRUFF, IAN	POLIS, UNIVERSITY OF LEEDS	3RD	THE RELATIVE ECONOMIC SUCCESS OF SMALL EUROPEAN COUNTRIES: THE ROLE OF CULTURE AND LABOUR MARKET
✓ X CRUDEL, LUCA	SOAS, UNIVERSITY OF LONDON	1RS (+MSC)	THE INDIVIDUAL THROUGH THE LENSES OF SOCIAL CAPITAL
✓ FILIOU, DESPOINA	UMIST	3RD	STRATEGIC ALLIANCES IN BIOTECHNOLOGY: THE CASE OF THE UK
✓ KASIMATI, EVANGELIA	DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS AND INTERNATIONAL DEVELOPMENT, UNIVERITY OF BATH	2ND	THE MACROECONOMICS OF HOSTING MEGA EVENTS: A RESEARCH FOR EMPLOYMENT EFFECTS
✓ MANSI, KAMEL	UNIVERSITY OF MANCHESTER, LABOUR STUDIES	2ND	DETERMINANTS OF WOMEN'S PARTICIPATION IN LABOUR FORCE
✓ MCEVOY, PHIL	UNIVERSITY OF MANCHESTER, SCHOOL OF NURSING	3RD	AN EXPLORATION OF HOW THE DECISIONS MADE BY GATEKEEPERS CLINIČIANS AT THE GP/CMHT INTERFACE EMERGE
✓ MENDEZ, MARIA-LUISA	UNIVERSITY OF MANCHESTER	2nd	DEFINING SOCIAL CLASS AND ITS RECENT CHANGES IN CHILE
✓ NEVES, VITOR	Portugal	Lecturer	
✓ PACHECO-LOPEZ, PENELOPE (withdrawn)	UNIVERSITY OF KENT AT CANTERBURY, DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS	3RD	MEXICO'S TRADE STRUCTURE, TRADE REFORMS AND BALANCE OF PAYMENTS CENSTRAINED GROWTH
✓ POXON, JOHN	UNIVERSITY OF TEESIDE, DEPARTMENT OF SOCIAL SCIENCES	3RD	IS MARXIST THEORY STILL RELEVANT ON CLASS? AS FOR BRITISH EDUCATION IS CONCERNED?
✓ X RUZIEB, KOBIL	DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS, UNIVERSITY OF STIRLING	1RS (+MA)	PRIVATISATION OF STATE OWNED COMMERCIAL BANKS AND THE EFFECT OF THIS PROCESS ON MACROECONOMIC PERFORMANCE OF THE COUNTRY. CASE OF URBEKISTAN
✓ SOYDAN, AYLIN	MIDDLESEX, BUSINESS SCHOOL	3RD	PUBLIC SECTOR DEFICITS AND INFLATION
✓ STEFANOV, ILIYAN	DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS, UNIVERSITY OF DUNDEE	4TH	MORAL HAZARD IN BANKING DURING THE TRANSITION FROM CENTRALLY PLANNED ECONOMY RO A MARKET ECONOMY
✓ X VIGO, IARA	DEPARTMENT OF ECONOMICS, UNIVERSITY OF STIRLING	1ST	THINKING ABOUT MODERNISM AND POSTMODERNISM AS EPISTEMES
✓ X TIBA, ZOLTAN	SOAS, UNIVERSITY OF LONDON	2ND	AGRICULTURAL LIBALISATION AND FOOD SECURITY IN MALAWI
✓ Yonnedi, Efa	Institute for Development Policy & Management, Univ. of Manchester	1st	Privatisation in Indonesia: Determinants, organisational changes and performance implications
✓ Zhen Ye	Univ. of Hertfordshire	3rd	Transforming Institutions: The case of foreign direct investment in Siamen (China)

✓ James Morgan
 ✓ Karl Petrick